



DAY 2: GROUPS 5 AND 6



Group 5	Group 6
Albania	Bosnia and Herzegovina
Bosnia and Herzegovina	Croatia
Croatia	Montenegro
Hungary	Serbia
Montenegro	
Serbia	
Turkey	
Facilitator: Deanna Aubrey	Facilitator: Ljerka Crnković
Expert: Kay Brown	Experts: Lewis Hawke, WB
	Sandy Young Min, WB

- **Findings on discussions on Question 1**

RESULTS ACHIEVED

All countries have implemented reforms:

- **Improved regulations** (legislation on budget, internal audit, public procurement, fiscal responsibility, right of access to information).
- **Improved accountability of public resource managers** (impact on cost reduction)
 - ✓ CROATIA- procurement of official vehicles
 - ✓ BIH – Statement of responsibility, every institution manager in their annual reports (use of funds, implementation of the plans, etc.).
- **Implementation of reforms of IT systems** for publishing of information and improvement of internal efficiency (electronic submission of requests for funds – BiH, internal audit report, CHU – Turkey).

- **Progress in transparency made**
 - Budget- all countries publish budget calendar, budgets and forecasts, supplementary budgets, budget execution reports.
 - Financial reports – no countries publish financial reports, accounting reform underway.
 - Audit – external (state) audit reports are published after they are submitted to the parliament; internal audit reports are published as well.

GOOD PRACTICE EXAMPLES

- Law on right of access to information
 - Statement of fiscal responsibility
 - Public procurement law
 - Centralised payroll calculation
-
- ✓ SERBIA – local government – e-government, publishing of the public procurement process, **publishing of commitments** (suppliers, number of invoices, amounts, duration of delays)
 - ✓ MONTENEGRO – Law on financing of political parties (weekly reporting)
 - ✓ CROATIA – introducing of e-citizen portals, involving citizens in budget development (some cities)
 - ✓ Albania – publishing information on all paid invoices at the end of each day.

CHALLENGES

- **Further reform of legal framework**
- **Development of risk management**
- **Alignment of reporting standards in countries** (complex job, inventory of state assets,...)
- **Reforming IT systems for publishing of info and improvement of internal efficiency** (electronic submission of requests for funds – BiH, internal audit report CHU – Turkey)
- **Ongoing education**
 - Of employees (internal and internal audit, financial management and control, accounting, budget preparation)
 - Of users of published information (citizens, civil society, journalists, politicians)

RISKS

- **How information published on the web is used**
- **Reliability of information** in terms of :
 - ✓ Sources of information comes from
 - ✓ Quality of information (incomplete information)
- **Creating uncertainty and confusion in public due as a result of:**
 - ✓ Urgent adoption of legislation/ not enough time for public hearing and consultation
 - ✓ Having to meet urgent requirements of the EC
 - ✓ Subsequent amendments and changes causing legal uncertainty and confusion of the public
- **Lack of financial resources for:**
 - ✓ IT applications and new IT systems
 - ✓ Capacity building and staff education
- **Low level of awareness on accountability among the managers** (political changes)
- **Non-aligned development strategies**
- **Lack of coordination in implementation of strategic goals and ensuring continuity of coordination.**

RECOMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVEMENT

- Enable citizens to to provide their suggestions in budget preparation (problem: everything is done in the last minute)
- Web portals should offer more information for citizens.



CONCLUSION

- Complete transparency may be abused, data can be misinterpreted as a result of insufficient knowledge, understanding. The need to protect the data (permanent data, personal information, internal audit reports).
- Focus should be on the quality of reports.
- Every country should implement reforms at their own pace, without external pressures.
- Right reforms are more important than the right tools.



Thank you!